

## GCE

### **History A**

### Y316/01: Thematic study and historical interpretations: Britain and Ireland 1791-1921

A Level

### Mark Scheme for June 2023

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2023

#### MARKING INSTRUCTIONS

# PREPARATION FOR MARKING SCORIS

- 1. Make sure that you have accessed and completed the relevant training packages for on-screen marking: scoris assessor Online Training; OCR Essential Guide to Marking.
- 2. Make sure that you have read and understood the mark scheme and the question paper for this unit. These are posted on the RM Cambridge Assessment Support Portal <u>http://www.rm.com/support/ca</u>
- 3. Log-in to scoris and mark the **required number** of practice responses ("scripts") and the **number of required** standardisation responses.

YOU MUST MARK 5 PRACTICE AND 6 STANDARDISATION RESPONSES BEFORE YOU CAN BE APPROVED TO MARK LIVE SCRIPTS.

#### MARKING

- 1. Mark strictly to the mark scheme.
- 2. Marks awarded must relate directly to the marking criteria.
- 3. The schedule of dates is very important. It is essential that you meet the scoris 50% and 100% (traditional 40% Batch 1 and 100% Batch 2) deadlines. If you experience problems, you must contact your Team Leader (Supervisor) without delay.
- 4. If you are in any doubt about applying the mark scheme, consult your Team Leader by telephone or the scoris messaging system, or by email.

#### 5. Crossed Out Responses

Where a candidate has crossed out a response and provided a clear alternative then the crossed out response is not marked. Where no alternative response has been provided, examiners may give candidates the benefit of the doubt and mark the crossed out response where legible.

#### **Rubric Error Responses – Optional Questions**

Where candidates have a choice of question across a whole paper or a whole section and have provided more answers than required, then all responses are marked and the highest mark allowable within the rubric is given. Enter a mark for each question answered into RM assessor, which will select the highest mark from those awarded. (*The underlying assumption is that the candidate has penalised themselves by attempting more questions than necessary in the time allowed.*)

#### **Multiple Choice Question Responses**

When a multiple choice question has only a single, correct response and a candidate provides two responses (even if one of these responses is correct), then no mark should be awarded (as it is not possible to determine which was the first response selected by the candidate). When a question requires candidates to select more than one option/multiple options, then local marking arrangements need to ensure consistency of approach.

#### **Contradictory Responses**

When a candidate provides contradictory responses, then no mark should be awarded, even if one of the answers is correct.

#### Short Answer Questions (requiring only a list by way of a response, usually worth only one mark per response)

Where candidates are required to provide a set number of short answer responses then only the set number of responses should be marked. The response space should be marked from left to right on each line and then line by line until the required number of responses have been considered. The remaining responses should not then be marked. Examiners will have to apply judgement as to whether a 'second response' on a line is a development of the 'first response', rather than a separate, discrete response. (The underlying assumption is that the candidate is attempting to hedge their bets and therefore getting undue benefit rather than engaging with the question and giving the most relevant/correct responses.)

#### Short Answer Questions (requiring a more developed response, worth two or more marks)

If the candidates are required to provide a description of, say, three items or factors and four items or factors are provided, then mark on a similar basis – that is downwards (as it is unlikely in this situation that a candidate will provide more than one response in each section of the response space.)

#### Longer Answer Questions (requiring a developed response)

Where candidates have provided two (or more) responses to a medium or high tariff question which only required a single (developed) response and not crossed out the first response, then only the first response should be marked. Examiners will need to apply professional judgement as to whether the second (or a subsequent) response is a 'new start' or simply a poorly expressed continuation of the first response.

6. Always check the pages (and additional objects if present) at the end of the response in case any answers have been continued there. If the candidate has continued an answer there then add a tick to confirm that the work has been seen.

- 7. Award No Response (NR) if:
  - there is nothing written in the answer space

Award Zero '0' if:

• anything is written in the answer space and is not worthy of credit (this includes text and symbols).

Team Leaders must confirm the correct use of the NR button with their markers before live marking commences and should check this when reviewing scripts.

- 8. The scoris comments box is used by your team leader to explain the marking of the practice responses. Please refer to these comments when checking your practice responses. Do not use the comments box for any other reason. If you have any questions or comments for your team leader, use the phone, the scoris messaging system, or e-mail.
- 9. Assistant Examiners will send a brief report on the performance of candidates to their Team Leader (Supervisor) via email by the end of the marking period. The report should contain notes on particular strengths displayed as well as common errors or weaknesses. Constructive criticism of the question paper/mark scheme is also appreciated.
- 10. For answers marked by levels of response: Not applicable in F501
  - a. To determine the level start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
  - b. To determine the mark within the level, consider the following:

Descriptor	Award mark
On the borderline of this level and the one below	At bottom of level
Just enough achievement on balance for this level	Above bottom and either below middle or at middle of level (depending on number of marks available)
Meets the criteria but with some slight inconsistency	Above middle and either below top of level or at middle of level (depending on number of marks available)
Consistently meets the criteria for this level	At top of level

#### 11. Annotations

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
BP	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
A	Assertion
AN	Analysis
EVAL	Evaluation
EXP	Explanation
F	Factor
ILL	Illustrates/Describes
IRRL	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
J	Judgement
KU	Knowledge and understanding
Р	Provenance
SC	Simple comment
8	Unclear
V	View

### 12. Subject Specific Marking Instructions

Question Answer	Mark	Guidance
<ul> <li>1* Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of the progress in negotiations for Home Rule by 1914.</li> <li>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A presents the progress in negotiations for Home Rule as having made little headway by 1914. It emphasises the entrenched position taken by nationalists, Ulster Unionists and the government, which meant that no agreement was possible.</li> <li>In evaluating Interpretation A,         <ul> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as Asquith and the Liberal government's strong opposition to compromise over Partition is exemplified by the failure to include the possibility in the 1912 Home Rule Bill, despite an amendment being tabled to include it.</li> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid in presenting Redmond and the Irish Nationalists as opposing a compromise settlement, since he publicly argued that any division was an unacceptable solution (using the words 'abomination' and 'blasphemy')</li> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as the threats of Ulster Unionists to take</li> </ul> </li></ul>	30	<ul> <li>The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set.</li> <li>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</li> <li>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</li> <li>No set answer is expected.</li> <li>At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge, and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question.</li> <li>To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material.</li> <li>Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>

<ul> <li>by the UVF, and the evidence of nationalist gun-running, showed how entrenched the different viewpoints were.</li> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as the House of Lords amendments to the Home Rule Bill to include 9 counties, and the inability to reach an agreement over Tyrone and Fermanagh, made any compromise unlikely by 1914</li> </ul>			
<ul> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is not valid in emphasising the importance of lack of compromise since, even had the Unionist/Nationalist/Liberal leadership been able to reach a compromise in 1914, the unwillingness of the House of Lords to pass a Home Rule Bill meant that it would have been unlikely to succeed anyway.</li> <li>Answers might argue that Interpretation A is not valid in emphasising the extent of opposition to compromise, since by 1914 the concept of exclusion, or temporary exclusion, was becoming accepted as a possible solution by Asquith, Carson and Redmond.</li> </ul>			
In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B presents the negotiations as progressing well, due to the need to compromise to avoid civil war in Ireland. It argues that a compromise was close to being achieved when the First World War interrupted any agreement. In evaluating Interpretation B, • Answers might argue that Interpretation B			
• Answers might argue that merpretation b is valid in emphasising the significance of events in Ireland, since the development of			

	opposing paramilitary movements (UVF and	
	Irish Volunteers), the Larne gun running	
	event had increased fears of civil war in	
	Ireland.	
	Answers might argue that Interpretation B is	
	valid as the Curragh Mutiny had weakened	
	the confidence of the government in their	
	military presence in Ireland, contributing to a	
	willingness to compromise.	
	Answers might argue that Interpretation B is	
	valid as the 1914 Amending Bill which	
	<b>v</b>	
	presented a 'county option' of exclusion	
	showed that for Asquith and the Liberal	
	government some form of compromise was a	
	necessity.	
	Answers might argue that Interpretation B is	
	valid since at the 1914 conference, all parties	
	agreed to a four-county exclusion term, and	
	despite failing to reach an agreement, it was	
	clear that Partition in some form was being	
	accepted.	
	• Answers might argue that Interpretation B is	
	valid in emphasising the role of the First	
	World War, since a new Amending Bill was	
	postponed in the interests of national unity,	
	supported even by Redmond, but that this	
	contributed to the increased militancy of	
	some Irish Volunteers and the Easter	
	Uprising.	
	Answers might argue that Interpretation B is	
	not valid in seeing a compromise as	
	inevitable had war not broken out, since there	
	was no indication that Redmond, Carson and	
	the Lords were willing to agree beyond the	
	four-county proposal.	

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
2*	<ul> <li>'The Roman Catholic Church was consistently opposed to the Union from 1791 to 1921.' How far do you agree?</li> <li>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, <ul> <li>Answers may argue that the Catholic Church was a significant opponent of the Union through much of the period.</li> <li>Answers might consider the support of the Catholic Church, including Archbishop McHale, for O'Connell's Catholic Association in the 1820s.</li> <li>Answers might consider the continued dominance or influence of the Anglican faith even after Peel and Gladstone's reforms, as a factor leading to Catholic opposition to the Union.</li> <li>Answers might consider the support of the Catholic Church for nationalist groups during the Land Wars.</li> <li>Answers might consider the Catholic Church's support for Parnell's policies, in particular with nationalist ideals for protecting the Catholic Church with the revivalist movement for lrish culture, such as the Gaelic Athletic Association, as an expression of nationalist opposition to the Union.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Answers might consider the significance of the religious divide, the Catholic Church and the Catholic Church with the revivalist movement for lrish culture, such as the Gaelic Athletic Association, as an expression of nationalist opposition to the Union.</li> </ul>	25	<ul> <li>The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.</li> <li>Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.</li> <li>The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.</li> <li>No set answer is expected.</li> <li>At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the degree to which the Catholic Church was consistently opposed to the Union.</li> <li>To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material.</li> <li>Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>
I I I			9

In challenging the hypothesis in the question,	
Answers may argue that the Catholic	
Church on occasions opposed nationalism or	
held viewpoints that differed from nationalist	
opposition to the Union.	
<ul> <li>Answers might consider the impact of</li> </ul>	
Peel's response to the Maynooth Crisis, as	
well as the Colleges Bill (1844), in reducing	
to a limited degree an area of Church	
opposition to the Union.	
Answers might consider the significance of the line Church Act (4000) in the	
the Irish Church Act (1869) in the	
disestablishment of the Anglican Church which removed a major area of grievance for	
the Catholic Church and made religious	
issues less significant in the Nationalist	
agenda.	
<ul> <li>Answers might consider division between</li> </ul>	
the Fenians, who supported anti-clerical	
nationalism, and the Catholic Church, which	
suspected the Fenians were Freemasons	
and disliked their anti-clerical stance.	
<ul> <li>Answers might consider Pope Leo XIII's</li> </ul>	
decision to condemn the nationalist Plan of	
Campaign in 1886, and the subsequent	
Church condemnation of Parnell over his	
adultery.	
Answers might consider the Catholic	
Church's opposition to the Nationalist strike	
actions in 1913 in Dublin.	
Answers might consider public opposition	
of a large number of clergy within the	
Catholic Church to the IRA's violent campaign of terror 1919-1921, as well as the	
Church's support for the Provisional	
	<u>                                      </u>

	Government which signalled an acceptance of the new status quo.		
Question 3*		Mark 25	Guidance         The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.         Meither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.         The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.         • No set answer is expected.         • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the degree to which Partition and other events reduced tensions.         • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material.         • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

In challenging the hypothesis in the question,
Answers may argue that Partition was
limited in reducing tensions, and that other
events were more significant.
<ul> <li>Answers might consider that the Anglo-</li> </ul>
Irish Treaty further divided the Nationalists,
with a resulting wave of violence in Ireland
which led to civil war, executions and
murders in Ireland.
<ul> <li>Answers might consider the significance of the defeat of the United Irishmen in 1798 and</li> </ul>
the subsequent Act of Union 1800 in consolidating British control and reducing
overt tensions.
<ul> <li>Answers might consider the significance of the Catholic Emancipation Act (1829) in</li> </ul>
reducing tensions by allowing Catholic MPs
and paving the way for an Irish
Nationalist/Whig relationship.
<ul> <li>Answers might consider the impact of</li> </ul>
Peel's policies for Ireland in addressing some
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
grievances, such as education and local
government.
Answers might consider the significance of     Cladatene's policies in dispetablishing the
Gladstone's policies in disestablishing the
Anglican Church and limited reform of the
land and housing issues in the Land Acts
(1870 and 1881).
Answers might consider the significance of
the outbreak of the First World War, which
led a substantial part of the Nationalist
movement to voluntarily support the cause of
national unity for the duration of the war.

In challenging the hypothesis in the question,	
<ul> <li>Answers may consider that the Great</li> </ul>	
Famine had a less significant impact on Irish	
Nationalism than other factors.	
<ul> <li>Answers might consider that political</li> </ul>	
apathy in Ireland after the Famine meant that	
the Independent Irish Party disintegrated, the	
Conservative Party won 55/105 seats in	
1859, and the period is associated with a	
hardening of unionist sentiment in Ulster,	
whereas no defined Nationalist movement	
emerged from the Famine.	
Answers might consider that Irish     grisusaness such land supership, rept and	
grievances over land ownership, rent and	
food prices predated the Great Famine.	
Answers might consider the significance of the Maynooth Crisis for Irish Nationalism from	
an economic perspective, since it was an	
issue of state funding.	
Answers might consider the significance of	
the Land War in the 1870s as an economic	
motivation for revitalising Irish Nationalism,	
with direction from the Irish National Land	
League.	
<ul> <li>Answers might consider the failure of</li> </ul>	
Gladstone's Land Acts to address the	
fundamental economic issues behind Irish	
Nationalism.	
Answers might consider the indirect role of	
economic motives of the Ulster Unionists in	
refusing Home Rule, which led to an	
increased popular support for Irish	
Nationalism.	
Answers might consider the significance of     land reform in the party 1000s which allowed	
land reform in the early 1900s which allowed	
more tenant farmers to buy land and created	

•	a stronger economic base on which to argue for independence. <b>Answers might consider</b> the significance of industrialisation, especially in the North, in fuelling Nationalist opposition to a division of	
	Ireland with the Home Rule Bills.	

APPENDIX 1 – this contains a generic mark scheme grid

	AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.
	Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30]
Level 6 26–30 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 5 21–25 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 4 16–20 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 3 11–15 marks	The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 2 6–10 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
<b>Level 1</b> 1–5 marks	The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking.
0 marks	No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge.

	AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.
	Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25]
<b>Level 6</b> 21–25 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated.
<b>Level 5</b> 17–20 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated.
Level 4 13–16 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence.
<b>Level 3</b> 9–12 marks	The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence.
<b>Level 2</b> 5–8 marks	The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clearl.
<b>Level 1</b> 1–4 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence.
0 marks	The answer contains no relevant information.

#### Need to get in touch?

If you ever have any questions about OCR qualifications or services (including administration, logistics and teaching) please feel free to get in touch with our customer support centre.

Call us on

01223 553998

Alternatively, you can email us on

support@ocr.org.uk

For more information visit





Twitter/ocrexams

/ocrexams

/company/ocr

/ocrexams



OCR is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored. © OCR 2023 Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations is a Company Limited by Guarantee. Registered in England. Registered office The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA.

Registered company number 3484466. OCR is an exempt charity.

OCR operates academic and vocational qualifications regulated by Ofqual, Qualifications Wales and CCEA as listed in their qualifications registers including A Levels, GCSEs, Cambridge Technicals and Cambridge Nationals.

OCR provides resources to help you deliver our qualifications. These resources do not represent any particular teaching method we expect you to use. We update our resources regularly and aim to make sure content is accurate but please check the OCR website so that you have the most up-to-date version. OCR cannot be held responsible for any errors or omissions in these resources.

Though we make every effort to check our resources, there may be contradictions between published support and the specification, so it is important that you always use information in the latest specification. We indicate any specification changes within the document itself, change the version number and provide a summary of the changes. If you do notice a discrepancy between the specification and a resource, please <u>contact us</u>.

Whether you already offer OCR qualifications, are new to OCR or are thinking about switching, you can request more information using our Expression of Interest form.

Please get in touch if you want to discuss the accessibility of resources we offer to support you in delivering our qualifications.